Millennium Development Goals

Conceptual Framework: An Indigenous Peoples Perspective

Strategies and Actions for the Achievement of the Millennium Development Goals in Areas Inhabited by Indigenous Peoples
MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK:
AN INDIGENOUS PEOPLES
PERSPECTIVE

STRATEGIES AND ACTIONS
FOR THE ACHIEVEMENT OF
THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS
IN AREAS INHABITED BY INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

Pan American Health Organization
TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD ....................................................................................................................... 10

INTRODUCTION
Setting the context for the Millennium Development Goals from the Indigenous Peoples' Perspective ......................................................... 14

CHAPTER I

ANALYSIS OF THE
MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS TARGETS

1.1 Target 1:
Halve the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day................................................................. 19

1.2 Target 2:
Halve the proportion of people who suffer from hunger......................... 22

1.3 Target 3:
Ensure that children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling................................. 25

1.4 Target 4:
Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and at all levels of education no later than 2015......................................................................................................................... 28

1.5 Target 5:
Reduce, by two thirds the under-five mortality rate................................ 31

1.6 Target 6:
Reduce by three quarters, the maternal mortality ratio by 2015.... 35

1.7 Target 7:
Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS... 37
1.8  Target 8:
Have halted by 2015, and begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases................................................................. 37

1.9  Target 9:
Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources........................................................................................................ 39

1.10 Target 10:
Halve by 2015 the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water............................................................... 44

1.11 Target 11:
By 2020 to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers.................................................... 48

1.12 Targets 12 – 15:
Develop an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system, which includes a commitment to good governance, development and poverty reduction, both nationally and internationally.............................................................. 50

1.13 Target 16:
In cooperation with developing countries, develop and implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth......................... 56

1.14 Target 17:
In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable drugs in developing countries............................................. 57

1.15 Target 18:
In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communication technologies........................................................................................................ 60
CHAPTER II

PROPOSED TARGETS AND INDICATORS OF THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS WITH GREATER RELEVANCE FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES:

2.1 Target 1:
Increase by 50% until 2015, the restitution of territories to indigenous peoples and increase their saving capacity........................................63

2.2 Target 2:
Reduce by half, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger by 2015.......................................................................................................64

2.3 Target 3:
Until 2015, indigenous boys and girls would complete a course of primary schooling including life awareness and intercultural methodologies to foster the consolidation of their ethnic and cultural identity, as well as their self-esteem.......................................................64

2.4 Target 4:
Achieve equitable opportunities in primary and secondary education, for indigenous girls and boys at all levels of education by 2015.............65

2.5 Target 5:
Reduce by two thirds, the under five mortality rate, through the delivery of intercultural and holistic health services by 2015.................66

2.6 Target 6:
Reduce by three quarters, the maternal mortality ratio through the delivery of intercultural and holistic health services by 2015............67
2.7  Target 7:
Have halted and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS, taking into account indigenous peoples view of the world on sexuality and incorporating a human rights and collective rights approach by 2015................................................................. 69

2.8  Target 8:
Have begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases, incorporating the holistic approach to health of indigenous peoples in health programmes by 2015................................................................. 70

2.9  Target 9:
Integrate into national policies and programs, the principles of sustainable development, as perceived by indigenous peoples in their view of the world, and reverse the loss of environmental resources................................................................. 71

2.10  Target 10:
Reduce by half the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water by 2015................................................................. 72

2.11  Target 11:
By 2020, have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers................................................................. 73

2.12  Targets 12-15:
By 2015, obtain a total cancellation of the official debt which is considered illegitimate................................................................. 73

2.13  Target 16:
By 2015, succeed in generating productive employment for economically active men and women, by introducing greater dynamism in local, national and regional economies.......... 74
2.14 Target 17:
States, with the support of civil society in general and indigenous peoples in particular, shall protect biodiversity, including genetic and biological resources, and provide access to essential drugs, applying the principles of sovereignty and social protection...... 74

2.15 Target 18:
In cooperation with the private sector, States must ensure the technological and scientific development of indigenous peoples and nationalities, and make available the benefits of new information and communication technologies............................ 75

CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS:

3.1 Recommendations to States............................................................... 77

3.2 Recommendations to the United Nations System and other Cooperation Agencies................................................................. 78

3.3 Recommendations to Indigenous Peoples, Nationalities and Organizations.................................................................................. 80
The fifth session of the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (2006), made several recommendations explicitly commenting on the Millennium Development Goals: “During the dialogue with indigenous peoples on the Millennium Development Goals, many indigenous organizations made statements about the urgent need to redefine the Goals. While the Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues appreciates that it may not be possible to redefine the Goals, it also recognizes that there is a clear need to redefine approaches to the implementation of the Goals so as to include the perspectives, concerns, experiences and world views of indigenous peoples. Statements also confirmed that there was a need for indigenous peoples to provide their own definitions of poverty and development and that there should be full and effective participation of indigenous peoples in the implementation of the Goals”.

Within this context, the current document contributes to the discussion on how to achieve the Millennium Development Goals from the perspective of indigenous peoples. While this document might not fully reflect the rationale, worldviews and approaches of all indigenous peoples, who have their own specific circumstances, identities and needs (the Kichwas in the Andean territories and the Kichwas in the Amazon region will face different needs and resort to different solutions to overcome poverty), it provides an insight into their shared ideologies and views of the world. One such earthly view of the world is the Pachamama, the territory which is seen and felt as a vital element in the development of indigenous peoples, in a harmonious relationship between nature and runa (human being), and governed by the principles of sumac kawsay (living well). According to this view of the world, the rights
over the soil, subsoil and air are based on the principle of reciprocity, whereby land will bear fruit to sustain human lives and human beings, who will in turn, protect and take care of the land. The identification of common elements in indigenous peoples' views of the world has indeed made it possible to suggest scenarios for the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals in areas inhabited by indigenous peoples, by redrafting the different targets included under each goal.

In order to redraft and increase the potential implementation of the Millennium Development Goals, we need to identify and analyse the results obtained thus far through successful local experiences in indigenous territories which have been fostered by municipalities with indigenous authorities, indigenous organizations or indigenous communities. Our starting point was the community-generated evidence from the case of the Kichwa Sarayacu community in Ecuador, regarding MDG 8 on ensuring a sustainable environment and MDG 1 on the eradication of extreme poverty and hunger. The Sarayacu people were opposed to oil exploitation and currently develop community projects for sustainable and durable production. Another example is provided by the Municipal Government of Cotacachi, in Ecuador, where, after the Pan American Health Organization’s assessment, MDGs 4 and 5 have been achieved and MDGs 2, 8 will soon follow. The Kichwa Organization in Loreto will most certainly reach targets 4, 5 in the next years, thanks to the efforts deployed to reduce and eliminate inequalities. There is a wide range of successful experiences. The idea is to generate action and reflect upon the value and contribution of local proposals, and as in the examples provided, acting locally and thinking globally.
The real challenge however, is to articulate and correlate lessons learned in local experiences in order to contribute to a global change that will bring about improved living conditions for indigenous peoples.

Finally, it should be noted that this paper draws extensively on experiences in Ecuador and particular in the Kichwa territories, and therefore does not provide a complete overview of all indigenous peoples’ views of the world. Nevertheless, it does provide valuable insights to understand different indigenous peoples in the Americas. Thus, kichwa expressions such as ayllu (family); runa (human being), ranti-ranti (commercial or financial relations), minka (collective community contribution made to a family or vice-versa, for specific tasks), have been purposely used to illustrate the fact that these principles and codes are imbued in the daily lives of indigenous peoples and, that in other regions and countries, these and other expressions are undoubtedly used with similar content and meaning. Therefore, they deserve to be known, understood, respected, disseminated and incorporated into policies, projects, planes or programmes developed by indigenous peoples themselves or by national or international bodies, in order to make a decisive contribution to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals.

José Luis Di Fabio, PhD
Manager, Technology, Health Care and Research Area
Pan American Health Organization
INTRODUCTION

SETTING THE CONTEXT FOR
THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS
FROM INDIGENOUS PEOPLES’ PERSPECTIVE
THE BEGINNING OF A NEW MILLENNIUM MARKED THE RENEWED INTEREST FROM HEADS OF STATE AND GOVERNMENTS IN HIGHLIGHTING THE CENTRAL ISSUES OF THEIR POLITICAL AGENDAS AND ACTIONS.

THE LEADING GLOBAL GOALS SUCH AS PEACE, SECURITY, DISARMAMENT, POVERTY ERADICATION, SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT, DEMOCRACY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE, AMONGST OTHERS, AS IDENTIFIED IN THE EIGHT MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS REMAIN FROM LACK OF AN IN-DEPTH ANALYSIS OF THE UNDERLYING STRUCTURAL CAUSES AND INEQUITY. THUS, THE INCONSISTENCY BETWEEN THE CONTENT OF A GOAL WHICH AIDS TO ERADICATE EXTREME POVERTY AND HUNGER AND ONE OF ITS TARGETS WHICH SEeks TO “HALVE THE PROPORTION OF PEOPLE WHOSE INCOME IS LESS THAN ONE DOLLAR A DAY” IN A CLEAR ALLUSION TO EXTREME POVERTY.

THE MILLENNIUM DECLARATION STRESSES THE ASYMMETRIES BETWEEN AND WITHIN STATES. IT POINTS OUT THAT “HUMAN BEINGS MUST RESPECT ONE OTHER, IN ALL THEIR DIVERSITY OF BELIEF, CULTURE, AND LANGUAGE”. THE PRINCIPLE OF CULTURAL DIVERSITY IS CONSPICUOUSLY ABSENT, IN SPITE OF THE COMMITMENT ACCORDING TO WHICH “A CULTURE OF PEACE AND DIALOGUE AMONG ALL CIVILIZATIONS SHOULD BE ACTIVELY PROMOTED”, TOGETHER WITH INCLUSION—UNDERSTOOD AS THE INCLUSION OF THOSE THAT HAVE BEEN EXCLUDED, INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AMONGST OTHERS.
The references found in the Millennium Declaration do not go beyond reiterated anthropologic concepts and this is reflected in the identification of the Millennium targets.

It is not surprising, therefore, that when addressing the Millennium Development Goals, the fourth session of the United Nation Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (2005), stated that “The Forum notes with concern that indigenous issues are often absent from Millennium Development Goals and poverty reduction processes, and from Millennium Development Goals reports and poverty reduction strategy papers”. At its fifth session (2006), the Forum made specific recommendations urging countries to undertake national processes to implement the Millennium Development Goals with the full and effective participation of indigenous peoples.

A reflection that can have an impact on change and in broadening different approaches, particularly regarding targets and strategies, is related to the fact that “Indigenous peoples have the right to benefit from the Millennium Development Goals and from other goals and aspirations contained in the Millennium Declaration to the same extent as all others”\(^1\). From the perspective of indigenous peoples, the core issue is the type of development that should be promoted in order to transcend the “anti-poverty” or “poverty eradication” discourse that fails to address structural problems.

\(^1\) Recommendations made by the fourth session of the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues, Nueva York, 2005.
CHAPTER I

ANALYSIS OF
THE MILLENIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS TARGETS
CHAPTER I

ANALYSIS OF THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS TARGETS

Goal 1:

Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger

1.1 Target 1:

Halve the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day.

This target would be impossible to achieve if the beneficiaries are not clearly and unmistakably identified, with due consideration of the multicultural nature of our societies worldwide. If the need to respect cultural diversity is stressed but not the guiding principle of all projects and programmes, failure will ensue and resources will be lost or jeopardized.

To avoid this and as a starting point, countries should do away with the remnants of colonial times. One of these tendencies is the persistent tendency to homogenise - in this case poor people and those who suffer from hunger, dismissing the fact that they are the bearers of a culture and deserve respect. Any programme designed to meet their needs should, therefore, be adapted to their cultural identity.
According to the World Bank, indigenous peoples are the poorest of the poor. It might not be enough to achieve salary recovery and a stable economy, with reduced inflation and macroeconomic stability, in a world where indigenous peoples still live within community systems, free from bureaucratic dependency, in almost autonomous local micro economies. It is definitely not enough in a world where they still bear the sequels of usurpation in such obvious realities as the refusal to establish policies to provide access to or the legal ownership over lands which are, nonetheless, considered indigenous territories, or in the absence of policies which would foster real and culturally appropriate development, as well as indigenous peoples right to historical continuity.

The parameters used to define poverty differ. While for States and under MDG 1, extreme poverty encompasses individuals whose income is less than a dollar per day; for indigenous peoples, the notion of poverty (huaccha) is linked to the lack of land to work on, the loss of culturally appropriate quality food, a linguistic loss which undermines further knowledge development, and the exclusion from decision-making processes. In other words, the charitable and quantified vision intended to take care of persons who live on less than a dollar a day is far removed from the reality of indigenous peoples who live in exclusion and poverty. The homogenised notion and strategy devised to help the “poorest of the poor” ultimately violates the rights to which they are entitled.

Thus, States, national and international agencies, cooperation agencies and the United Nations should be responsible for the collection of statistical data broken down in correlation with the cultural diversity principle since we live in pluri-cultural societies. This also implies the need to create new culturally appropriate indicators that would enable
the identification of the actual conditions of indigenous and non-indigenous populations living in poverty and extreme poverty. A comparative chart of national and sub-national data where inequity gaps are identified could be a useful tool in identifying priorities and fostering the adequate and appropriate implementation of participatory programs and projects conducive to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals.

Furthermore, all simplistic approaches must be avoided if the goals are to be attained. It is not enough to establish a correlation between economic growth rates and income redistribution in order to obtain an average rate of annual income growth per capita. Simulation models based on pessimist, moderate or optimist scenarios of economic growth rate, with no intervention on inequity patterns, will inevitably result in averages that hide the concentration of income in a few hands.

In the case of Ecuador, the MDG implementation report for 2005 acknowledges that even with high economic growth scenarios, the country will be unable to meet the proposed targets. In a fleeting statement in the same document, however, it is stated that these targets could be achieved if “political actions were to be simultaneously undertaken to reduce the concentration of income”. The question then would be, what are we waiting for to adopt such measures? Addressing structural issues and the implementation of the cultural diversity principle are elements of paramount importance in the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals.

2 According to the 2005 MDG Report surveys on living conditions indicate that extreme poverty in Ecuador increased from 13% to 15.5% between 1995 and 1999. A 50% reduction to 7.7% could not be achievable even under the most optimistic scenario for economic growth
It could be said that a general rule seems to have emerged in which “a greater redistributive effort is required with lesser per capita income growth”. In other words, this same rule could imply that “less redistributive effort is required with greater economic growth”. This would seem logical and consistent. Nonetheless, such rationale would tend to preserve poverty compounded with a highly discriminatory content. In order to achieve the first Millennium Development Goal, the right path would be to opt for the rule of the greatest effort, otherwise, all policies or actions aimed at achieving that Goal, as assessed from the perspective of indigenous peoples, would be tarnished with inequity, injustice, discrimination and non-compliance.

1.2 Goal 2:

Halve the proportion of people who suffer from hunger

It has been rightly acknowledged that poverty and malnutrition go hand in hand, but the current approach to this problem is still partial and unstructured. It does not deal with the root causes of poverty and hunger. In the case of indigenous populations, an approach that divides the ayllu (family-community) is unceivable. When it is stated that “malnutrition affects mainly rural and indigenous populations” and the target groups for remedial actions are children between two and five years old, there is a whole malnourished demographic group, such as pregnant women, elderly and disabled people who are excluded from this.
The *ayllu* concept imposes global and comprehensive actions to benefit all members of the family or community. In an approach intended to encompass all parts of a unit and to solve malnutrition it is not appropriate to implement training programs only on breastfeeding and child nutrition, or nutrition in general, or to provide enriched food with vitamins and micronutrients. That vision of the problem further increases hunger and dependency.

In Latin America in general, and Ecuador in particular, government programs are both “focalised” and temporary. When resources run out, so do programs. In the specific case of indigenous peoples, hunger and dependency are further exacerbated due to the fragmentation of the *ayllu*.

Many may question the kind of action that should be taken. Indigenous people consider that malnutrition will remain a problem for as long as they are denied access to legal tenure or ownership of land and territories, as well as to culturally relevant credit policies and support to strengthen their knowledge and technologies. Consequently, from the holistic and interrelated view of the world of indigenous peoples, any action in this field should be linked to an in-depth land reform that contemplates land handovers and access to preferential credit, taking into account indigenous peoples cultural codes, as their contribution to this economic and financial sector.

Likewise, feeding and nutrition programs intended for two to five year olds, or school breakfast and lunch programs that are not culturally relevant, could, in fact, exacerbate child malnutrition. A case in point is the negative impact of the equivocal notion of modernity in indigenous communities; for example, the generalised use of noodles to replace traditional products such as *quinoa*, beans, peas and wheat, amongst others. For example, modernity has been associated...
to the incorporation of chemicals to obtain “increasingly abundant” crops, the use of inadequate technology that has ultimately eroded farmlands, and the single crop policy to serve and control domestic and international markets. The “beneficiaries” of all this have accumulated extensive fortunes and brought certain States to their knees. They have a name: transnational corporations that concentrate wealth and have contributed to changing our feeding habits with an adverse effect leading to malnutrition. In Ecuador, for instance, flour imports were promoted to the extent that wheat farms have virtually disappeared, though the trade of this product is controlled by transnational corporations. Structural weaknesses are at the heart of the problem by freely allowing wealth concentration. In Leonardo Boff’s words, “If we want to become rich and hoard... there is no point in seeking advice from indigenous peoples; however, if we want to be happy and bring humans beings closer to the divine, to integrate persons (society), and nature, to make work compatible with leisure, to harmonize relations between generations... then we should talk to them”.

Something similar happens with programs designed to “improve access to and quality of health services” in order to eradicate poverty. Accessibility is not the only aspect to be considered, neither is the “quality” of services, which ultimately violates the rights of indigenous peoples since they ignore the fact that in these differentiated societies health encompasses both an internal and external balance (the harmonious coexistence of human beings and nature), together with the strengthening of their health systems and the appreciation of their own health workers/promoters.

For as long as a health system with a pluri-cultural approach closely linked to land use, food and education is not implemented, it would be impossible to achieve the MDG second target related to the reduction of hunger and malnutrition.
Goal 2:

Achieve universal primary education

1.3 Target 3

Ensure that children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling

In principle, this target identifies education parameters of the Western world but fails to take into account cultural diversity. Access to education is positively emphasised but just for a number of years of basic education in isolation from other education levels. Furthermore, curriculum for those years does not contemplate any intercultural type of education for the student population as a whole, in order to lay the foundations of a respectful society where all rational approaches could be freely exercised. This would demonstrate the democratization of a culturally relevant type of education.

In acknowledging the “deterioration of schooling system efficiency”, we must single out the following determining factors, among others: curricula contents are not adapted to realities, education models are copied or imposed,
education is not based on local cultures nor on ancestral knowledge, teachers are unfamiliar with their teaching environment, texts are either translated or adapted and do not incorporate codes found in multicultural societies.

For indigenous peoples, the schooling age (10 years) to complete a full cycle of basic education is relative. Indigenous children’s first learning environment is their daily coexistence with their mothers; their contact with their surroundings is an exercise of knowledge in action. In other words, while Western education trains people with an egocentric bias, dissociated from their “being” and “existing”, indigenous peoples education is geared towards a more dynamic type of learning based on “being while existing”. The key elements in knowledge development through the education and learning process (existing, being, doing) are present in five essential components: yachai (knowledge related to epistemology), munai (love, related to passion and intuition), rurai (action that implies direct living experience and building), ushai (power equivalent to potency, strength and energy) and kausai (life: beginning and end; what ends gives way to a beginning). In sum, this type of learning aims at recuperating, valuing and consolidating ancestral knowledge without dismissing knowledge from other cultures. The following levels of learning are observed:

- Learn to think while doing things in community (theory and practice);
- Learn to learn;
- Learn to un-learn and re-learn;
- Learn to undertake;
- Learn throughout life.
From indigenous peoples' perspective on education, it will not be possible to attain this target as proposed. Indigenous peoples' conception of education transcends the notions of age groups, a complete cycle of basic education, investment per capita in education, quality of education and expenditure, infrastructure, budget or ruralisation, under which it is intended to categorize indigenous peoples.

Hence the queries associated with the idea of “literacy campaigns for young mothers, in rural areas, to raise their awareness regarding the importance of their children's education”3. Are all young mothers in rural areas members of indigenous communities? Would it be enough to increase their awareness regarding the importance of education when no cultural codes have been considered? When no proper conditions have been provided as far as infrastructure, equipment or roads are concerned? That is, when the campaign has been designed in isolation from rural realities and even more so from indigenous peoples realities.

Furthermore, the investment -and non “expenditure”, approach to education must incorporate several factors: the national implementation of an intercultural education policy; the incorporation of adequate multicultural pedagogic methods and of native languages where indigenous students are represented; the reallocation of budgetary resources with an ethnic and cultural focus in order to achieve a comprehensive model of education linked to the social, economic, productive, ethnic and cultural aspects of life; as well as the incorporation of hands-on knowledge of indigenous peoples in textbooks. Once again, the principle of cultural diversity emerges as a must if the MDGs in this field are to be achieved.

3. This is one of the challenges included by the Government of Ecuador in the 2005 progress report on the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals, under Target 3, this is, “Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling (10 years).
Goal 3:

Promote gender equality and empower women

1.4 Target 4

Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015

Unfortunately, gender equity has also been undermined amongst indigenous peoples either through their own practices or due to the colonizing processes. In the past, indigenous women and men suffered from the lack of access to formal education. Knowledge was, nonetheless, transmitted on the basis of cultural codes and strategies adopted by indigenous peoples. Once the right to bilingual and/or intercultural education was determined an established right, access to education for indigenous men and women increased. However, indigenous women have had to overcome more hurdles in the access to both formal and bilingual intercultural education due to structural factors associated with discrimination and a weakened exercise of the duality –complementarity principle (man – woman) as the
pillar of the ayllu, which has introduced imbalances in gender relations.

In the case of indigenous peoples, gender equity consecrated as “equal opportunities and rights” is not enough. The recognition of the man/woman balance, or kari/warmi, leads us back to a key concept in indigenous rationality: the runa. For Kichwa peoples, “runa” is a concept that refers to the individual, the human, cosmic being, strongly linked to the Mother Earth or Pachamama, which beyond individual subjects, is a reference to the community and the people. Hence, “runa-kai” is the concept that defines and identifies the community collective subject, the ayllu.

The “complementary duality” principle, or kariwarmikai, in indigenous wisdom, means that the presence of an opposite invariable entails the presence of the other pole. Thus, opposites are complementary and not necessarily contradictory in nature. In other words, complementary opposites make up a whole, complete and comprehensive unit, where differing elements play a role in achieving a balanced internal coexistence.

This explains why, in the Kichwa (Inca) view of the world, at the origin of humanity we find Manco Cápac and Mama Ocllo as the man/woman pair, each distinct in nature but complementary to one another, and jointly responsible for consolidating the balance between human beings, nature and society. Consequently, it is not merely the search for equal opportunities or gender equity as it is a competition between two individuals.
From this perspective, a step forward would include the recovery, consolidation and re-creation of the indigenous philosophy through which the implementation of dissemination strategies incorporate the conceptual framework on gender equity. Any gender focus incorporated as a cross-cutting component in public policies, academic analysis or in the implementation of social and economic policies must consider the underlying philosophy of gender equity as perceived in the indigenous view of the world. This, combined with budgets prepared with gender, ethnic and cultural awareness, and culturally relevant indicators to break down data will provide us with the first result: a real picture of our multicultural societies and the identification of adequate targets and strategies to be achieved and implemented with and within indigenous peoples.
ANALYSIS OF THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS TARGETS

Goal 4: Reduce child mortality

1.5 Target 5: Reduce by two thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate.

Goal 5: Improve maternal health

1.6 Target 6: Reduce by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality ratio

It should be stressed that, for indigenous peoples, land is a space intimately linked to the human condition as social beings. Land is where the social, legal and organizational foundations of the individual and collective entity are rooted and expressed in their view of the world regarding life, health, illness, well-being, etc. By dispossessing indigenous peoples from their territories, their full development was thwarted, leading them to extreme levels of poverty once their land was no longer the essential component of individual and collective well-being. Deprived of land, indigenous people experienced poverty. Poverty is a determining factor in child and maternal mortality. These are not isolated facts but rather a consequence of past actions.
Over five centuries have passed since the Americas were invaded. As a result, though indigenous peoples in Ecuador view health and wellness as the balanced coexistence of runa (human beings) with themselves, others, nature and the cosmos, this collective view of the world shared by nearly 35% of the Ecuadorian population, has been unable to influence the institutional health care model. Under this model, human beings are the sum of several fragments (eyes, brain, nose, heart...). When affected by illnesses, the specific fragments are treated. That is how extremely important programmes dealing with free child and mother care, epidemiological surveillance, nutrition for under five year olds and others issues, work in isolation, with no integration or structured links between them. Consequently, such interventions are counterproductive, particularly when they involve indigenous peoples. They contribute to the ayllu’s disintegration (there is no comprehensive family care; only sick members are treated); nutrition habits and culture are disrupted with the use of fortified flours instead of locally grown food with high nutritional content, and any treatment is exclusively given to a sick person with the usual recommendation from physicians and nurses to “keep it for yourself and beware not to give it to any brothers or sisters”. Such interventions generate dependency as indigenous peoples gradually lose, forget or abandon their knowledge and demand the “miracle flour” which does not always arrive and the malnourished relapse into their initial lack of adequate nutrients.

In addition, health programmes are designed for concentrated urban populations. When planning for programmes, projects or activities, State institutions responsible for public health protection (MOH) do not take into account the geographic space of indigenous
peoples' settlements. Most of them are located on mountain-tops or foothills, exposed to freezing cold winds, on arid soils, accessible only by a few dirt roads that remain blocked or closed to traffic during many months of the year. In the case of indigenous peoples living in the Amazon Region, their means of access and transport are either canoes or motor planes which are far too expensive. The truth is that when a pregnant woman requires help in a complicated childbirth, or a child needs emergency care the patient’s parents, husbands, wives or relatives must walk 4 or 5 hours, or cross dangerous rivers to reach the nearest health centre. When and if individuals manage to surmount these difficulties, they are welcomed at public health services with accusations and are often mistreated. Also, poor families cannot afford to pay for emergency health care. This clearly explains why mother and child mortality rates and other indicators are significantly higher in provinces with a greater concentration of indigenous populations.

If we refer back to indigenous peoples' concept of health and well-being, the ideal solution would be to incorporate the balance in the design of health projects and programmes. This would enable comprehensive, timely, family, community and intercultural health care.

- All health programmes should encompass the ayllu (not only individual patients) and the community. (Family health history).
- Work in the community and its surroundings should be coordinated with and have the commitment of other sectors: roads, environmental sanitation, housing, agricultural production, irrigation, transport, environment and others.
• Recuperate and integrate indigenous peoples’ knowledge, practices and wisdom on health matters in the Ecuadorian government health programmes.

• Design and implement an ambulatory health system consistent with the reality of indigenous peoples’ locations, which incorporate indigenous and community talent.

• Design and implement a timely emergency care system with the inclusion of community human resources who would provide support and act as liaisons.

• Involve community councils in health care actions. This shared management with community leaders will gain political support for health programmes and will foster community empowerment over their individual and collective health.

• Incorporate in health care protocols, standards, procedures and rules, and elements consistent with indigenous peoples cultural diversity (vertical childbirth, infusions, appropriate clothing to protect women’s modesty, family support, to mention a few). Numerous current initiatives provide intercultural health services.
Goal 6:

**Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases**

1.7 Target 7:

**Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS**

HIV/AIDS, more than any other disease, is intimately related to individual and collective behaviours, attitudes, practices, values and views of the world regarding life, health or illness. This is true to such an extent that UNAIDS recommends taking into account these aspects in the development of strategies to avoid the spread of the disease.

Notwithstanding these recommendations, actions undertaken by public institutions (MOH), non-profit private organizations (NGOs), or private for profit organizations fail to include the principle of cultural diversity. Their programmes, activities, plans or projects often homogenize all information and standardize procedures, protocols and rules related to HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment. This approach to the problem has contributed to replicating inequalities and perpetuating inequity in health care and lack of access to education and training in HIV/AIDS for indigenous peoples.

Throughout the complete cycle of actions related to HIV/AIDS, the design and implementation phases must include the participation of indigenous peoples. In other words, sexual and reproductive rights, HIV/AIDS, and other related issues, must be approached from the perspective of the ethnic ownership of an individual who,
at the same time, belongs to a collective entity (*kichwa, shuar, achuar* community), because cultural frameworks are relevant in the full development of individual lives.

Furthermore, knowledge and information sources must be democratised (design of information, communication and education programmes) and indigenous peoples must be involved in decision-making on “what should be said, taught and learned”. In sum, a real intercultural communication must be established on the basis of respect for other people’s knowledge or lifestyles; i.e. to be willing to understand others with no strings attached.

The following recommendations can be made in this regard:

- KAP (knowledge, attitudes and practices) studies could be made on issues related to health, sexual and reproductive health, sexually transmitted infections (STIs) and HIV/AIDS, with the active participation of indigenous peoples and nationalities;

- Based on KAP studies results, different tools and strategies could be identified to launch education and training programmes aimed at preventing and stopping the spread of HIV/AIDS, STIs and other diseases. They could also be useful in creating greater community awareness about risks, HIV/AIDS determining factors, and States’ responsibility to protect at-risk populations (such as indigenous peoples) subject to poverty conditions, high migration levels, illiteracy and others;

- Set an ethnically-relevant baseline on the incidence and prevalence of HIV/AIDS, STIs and other diseases;

- Ensure the availability of antiretroviral treatment for indigenous populations already affected by the disease.
1.8 Target 8:

Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases

Current programmes implemented to eradicate malaria, tuberculosis and other diseases vividly illustrate an exclusively biomedical, fragmentary and individualized approach. In the case of malaria, dengue fever, haemorrhagic dengue fever and other diseases, programmes include spraying, pharmacologic treatment of patients, and drugs advisories or drugs freely handed over to people travelling to affected sites. Year after year a certain number of new cases are expected and reiterated medical emergencies are declared; large sums are allocated to purchase drugs and pesticides for spraying brigades. In spite of this, each year a similar number of adults, adolescents and children die of these diseases. These programmes tackle the effects, not the root causes of diseases.

In the case of malaria, indigenous peoples demand the inclusion of environmental improvement in current programmes. To this end, the Ministry of Public Health must mobilize and seek the support of other sectors and stakeholders.

- Community councils should be involved in health programmes in order to foster mobilization and the adoption of protective measures at community, family and individual level.
• Community human resources should be incorporated since they could motivate community cooperation in all health programme phases (health prevention, health promotion) and help to integrate contributions from other sectors.

• Both the Spanish-speaking and the bilingual education sectors should be associated in the implementation of information, communication and education programmes in order to promote the conscious and informed participation of communities, families and individuals.

• Resources allocated to health emergencies should take into account constant environmental improvement, in cooperation with other sectors and stakeholders. Thus, the complete eradication of breeding ground for vectors could be programmed. The following could be some of the main actions to be adopted:

  ▪ Provide safe or drinking water supply (breeding grounds would disappear since families would not need to store water which is usually polluted and is the main source for breeding grounds).

  ▪ Build systems for water drainage in order to avoid the accumulation of stagnant used waters where mosquitoes breed.

  ▪ Implement programmes to build sewage systems or other alternative mechanisms for waste water disposal.

  ▪ Mobilize community support with the cooperation of municipalities, prefects’ offices and other authorities to eliminate weeds and bushes, debris, clean irrigation canals, etc.
In addition to what has been previously mentioned, in the case of tuberculosis, programmes should aim at improving the nutritional status of families and communities in general, and those affected by the disease, in particular. The improvement of environmental and housing conditions should be essential components of any programme. It could be said that the MDGs would remain unattainable if a holistic approach is not incorporated in programmes geared towards the eradication of malaria, dengue fever, tuberculosis and other major diseases.

Goal 7:

Ensure environmental sustainability

1.9 Target 9:

Integrate the principles of sustainable development in country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources.

In order to stop the environmental degradation that has significantly reduced forest areas with the ensuing loss of biodiversity, pollution due to “sprawling” industrialization, and increased CO2 emissions as a result of del CO2 fuel-intensive societies, it is not enough to merely incorporate an environmentally sustainable dimension in public policies. This is particularly true in the case of macroeconomics or social policies dealing with poverty reduction or in sectorial and fragmentary policies such as mining, tourism or agriculture and animal husbandry.
Nor is it enough to tap “cleaner energy sources”, to implement mega hydroelectric projects, or to implement the Montreal Protocol on the protection of the ozone layer. It is not even enough to develop a number of disperse strategies on forestry, biodiversity or economic growth.

Faced with an unstructured vision of nature subject to human control, indigenous peoples consider that the concept of sustainable development is not exclusively related to economic returns, social sustainability or the conservation of biodiversity. It is rather a way to conceive and build development based on an economic model, which is actually a life model that seeks equity and a harmonious coexistence between all beings: human beings, nature and society. It is related to a certain lifestyle and type of society expressed in the sumac kawsay where the principle of relations, as understood by indigenous peoples, affirms that all elements are parts of a whole: the Hanan Pacha (the world above, the world of gods), the Uku Pacha (the world beneath), the Kai Pacha (this world and his time). Each part respects the other and are the master builders of the environment and the universe where all elements are integrated, articulated and connected to one another.

Biodiversity is intertwined with the realm of the sacred, the knowledge and lifestyles that have enabled its protection to this day as an important heritage. Biodiversity is also linked to medicine and health since it has been the cradle of universal pharmacopeia; it is linked to myths, rituals and symbolisms, with the way authority is generated and exercised; with the institutions developed by indigenous peoples, with the territory where good governance principles are put into practice by indigenous peoples;
with food and feeding habits, with celebrations and festivals, with dances, with religion, with architecture, with literature, with justice, with social relations and with wisdom to preserve natural wealth and promote societies firmly based on equity and justice leading to the exercise of the principles of harmony and balance.

A myth that might help in understanding the above is refers to the origins of maize.

Many different mythological tales exist about maize. It is said that maize used to be hidden under a mountain or a huge boulder, in a place only ants could reach and take the grains. When human beings saw that rats, weasels, foxes and other animals fed on the precious grains, they requested help from the gods. Though it was not such an easy task even for them, they succeeded in bringing out this valuable food which became one of the most important elements in human beings diet.

In the Chilam Balam of Chumayel, the Mayan book of sacred tales, this deed was accomplished by Chaac, god of rain and thunder. This explains why maize was first white, but when one of the gods threw a lightning to break the boulder, it burned several grains and some turned yellow and others black or red.

The woodpecker is included in other tales as the assistant of the gods and helper of human beings. It is said that its red head is tinted with the blood it lost when it was hurt by a piece of shrapnel while extracting the maize.
In the “Popol Vuh: The Ancient Quiché Tales”, by Adrián Recinos, it is said that human beings were made of maize. The gods used mud to make the first Mayas-Quichés but they did not last: they were soft and lacked strength; they fell apart before they could walk.

Then they tried with wood. The wooden dolls talked and walked; but they were dry; they lacked blood and substance, they had neither memory, nor sense of purpose. They did not know how to talk to the gods or could find nothing to tell them.

Then the gods used maize to make fathers and mothers. They used yellow and white maize to knead their flesh.

The maize men and women could see as much as the gods. Their eyesight would extend as far as the world.

The gods blew a mist and blurred their vision forever because they did not want human beings to see beyond the horizon⁴.

The Popol Vuh, mentions a specific place as the cradle of maize: “Paxil-Tlalocan” which means “fertile land” or “paradise on Earth” (located today in the central region of the State of Veracruz, in Mexico). Mayas considered maize as a gift from gods to human beings and thus, to cultivate it and take care of it was considered a sacred duty. It was valued to such extent that it was symbolically given the same dimension or importance given to jade, which was considered a symbol of power⁵.


⁵ Nina Pacari, in her presentation: Maize: A Symbol of Identity, Rituals and Resilience.
For this reason, a colonialist bias undermines programmes that include the so-called participation of local populations in managerial activities, particularly of indigenous communities residing in or nearby protected areas. This approach deprives indigenous peoples of their condition as possessors of knowledge and owners of highly bio-diverse lands and territories to become mere stewards of “environmental management”. In even more worrying cases, environmental management is the responsibility of ecological Non Governmental Organizations.

It must be stressed that unless an effort is made to plan for a model of society that would drive away from consuming patterns and superfluous comfort, mainstreaming the principles of sustainable development in national policies would be neither enough, nor an adequate solution to reverse the loss of natural resources or the increasing environmental damage translated in climate change and the ensuing natural disasters we witness today.

This core issue is also closely linked to good governance, power and multicultural citizenship. Indigenous peoples are contributing in all these areas from active local governments where they have implemented in public management the good governance standards of: ama llulla (shall not lie), ama shuwa (shall not steal) and ama killa (shall not be lazy).

In sum and to conclude, it could be said that new lifestyles and a new model of society must be promoted, together with the implementation of new models of development and a new economic order based on the principle of cultural diversity, gender and generation awareness, human rights, equity and justice, amongst others.
1.10 Target 10:

Halve by 2015 the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water

In indigenous peoples’ view, water is one of the world’s constituent elements that cannot be considered in isolation from others such as, i.e. land and territory, biodiversity, river basins, lifestyles, resource management, rituals and sacred realms, health and justice.

From the perspective of indigenous peoples, water is much more than a vital resource for subsistence and its importance is not limited to economic or legal impacts. The indigenous vision of water is based on three basic elements.

- **Water is considered a source of life** and divine nature. Water, as the origin of life and of the universe is associated with the divine. This is the foundation of the cult for water. Water is also related to the religious dimension. This explains why rites and ceremonies linked to water are so important. For example, the day a baby is born, the day someone is judged for a conduct that disrupts order and harmony, or baths (in pugyos-water sources or waterfalls) taken on the day preceding the *Inti Raimi* (Sun Festival) celebrated by the Kichwa people in June remain important examples.

- According to indigenous perceptions, water is a living being. It is constantly moving and flowing. Water is alive and has a soul (*energy-samai*) because of the relation between human beings and nature is based on correspondence and not control over one another.
The relationship is based on dialogue and reciprocity in order to understand each other and be able to coexist, in a complementary relationship. The names given to two of the most well known rivers of the Andean Highlands witness the importance of water: Apurimac, or the Talking God, and Vilcanota, or Sacred River.

The final element in the *indigenous perception of water is its place as an element in unity*. In indigenous peoples' view of the world, water cannot be dissociated from its environment or from the community. The principle of mutual relations and holistic approach is stressed in this assertion.

Therefore, the achievement of quality of life through the provision of potable water, sanitation, solid waste and used water management and other essential services is just a part of what is required. What about the lack of infrastructure and public investment in irrigation to feed the earth, improve the quality of soils and increase productivity? What measures could be adopted to preserve the sacred nature of water among indigenous peoples? Water is an undeniable component of development. The holistic understanding of water is related to culture, the sacred and symbolic dimensions, and even with the Goal to eradicate poverty and hunger.

As far as indigenous peoples are concerned, this Target has to be readapted on the basis of the principle of cultural diversity. Projects and programmes must not only be aimed at providing access to water, but also to promoting investment in required elements of infrastructure such as irrigation canals; to implement incentives for the custodians of water sources and water basins, such as indigenous communities who live in the moorlands;
to enhance respect for sacred sites such as waterfalls or water sources, in order to preserve and strengthen indigenous peoples lifestyles and myths through which the historic memory has been preserved and the social and legal standards of a differentiated society have been transmitted.

Permanent water drops used to fall in a corner of the Cuicocha lake, in the Cotacachi Canton of the Province of Imbabura, which the Kichwa people believed to be the tears of Mama Cotacachi (Cutaicachi). It is said that Taita Imbabura and Mama Cotacachi were married in ancient times. In his youth, Taita Imbabura, had been a womanizer and for some time was also Mama Tungurahua’s partner. During this estrangement, Rucu Pichincha came to Cuicocha and decided to stay and protect Mama Cotacachi. Beautiful Wawa Pichincha was born from this relationship. Such matters were of “public” or rather “divine” knowledge; so much so, that all gods –this is, all mountains, were summoned to a general meeting. Order had been disrupted and harmony had to be restored. After heated debates it was decided that the ayllus (family and marriage) had to be preserved. Thus, Mama Cotacachi and Taita Imbabura continued their life together, while Wawa Pichincha had to stay next to his solitary father. Since then, “father and son” live together, as a family, while Mama Cotacachi though having preserved her couple-family, continues to weep over the Cuicocha lake (Gods’ lake) tears of sorrow caused by the separation and distance from her son, Wawa Pichincha.

While we shall not dwell upon the social and legal implications found in this myth. It should be highlighted that those tears have been dried up by climate change.
In other words, climate change, brought about by environmental deterioration, mainly caused by developed countries, would be doing away with much more than a myth or a tale. An entire social and institutional structure would be affected; a complete fabric of social and regulatory relations that preserved a style of life, knowledge and development through myths and symbolism, would be affected. In indigenous peoples’ view of the world, myths enable access to knowledge in a different format. Myths incorporate symbols as a way to mediate reality. In order to understand and know myths the person must resort to different levels of comprehension and intuition. This runs counter to the way reality is examined in the Western world.

From the perspective of indigenous peoples, it could be stated that climate change is the warning signal that indicates the disruption of this balance, the indication that all beings, including human beings are being killed, together with their culture, institutions, and resources. It is a new form of genocide, as our elders rightly point out. However, this claim is construed by the Western world as a forecast when they affirm that “in the coming decades, major fights and disputes will be related to water”.

The achievement of the Millennium Development Goals and Targets will be impossible if we continue on this fragmentary path.
1.11 Target 11:

By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers.

The core issue is not access to “decent” housing or to a “private-public” partnership. Communities are excluded as subjects of interest (indigenous peoples as beneficiaries of interventions) in the promotion of housing construction, or in the allocation of resources in order to satisfy the needs of low-income sectors.

Among indigenous peoples, joint community work (or minga) is still a basic component of community economic systems. The reality of indigenous peoples must be well known before undertaking the implementation of housing programmes to benefit them. Most indigenous peoples live in rural areas and others in urban marginal areas. However, all of them have preserved their traditions, ancestral knowledge and the practice of minga, amongst others.

Therefore, housing policies should consider indigenous peoples identity and culture in the financing, joint management and implementation of housing models intended for their use.

Financing aspects should consider the following criteria: flexibility in instalments, taking into account the notion of savings; the type of activities, for instance, to adapt payments within the agricultural calendar; the feasibility of in kind payments.
The golden principle should be that “whoever has less financial resources should be granted more financial facilities”. A pluri-cultural society needs to develop open policies where the specificities of a pluri-cultural society that promotes equity and justice should be taken into account.

**In the area of joint management**, these programmes should count on the participation of beneficiaries (individual or collective members of indigenous peoples), since *minga* (community work) is practiced both at family and community levels. Family or community joint management through *mingas* will contribute to strengthen ancestral institutions, while demonstrating that contribution of counterparts in this exercise promotes equality, equity and justice. Thus, one of the rules of the principle of intercultural interpretation would be applied: “the higher the level of cultural conservation and development, the greater the autonomy of these peoples”.

**The housing models** promoted under these programmes disrupt indigenous peoples’ environments and lifestyles. The recovery and implementation of architectural practices adapted to indigenous peoples view of the world (ancestral technologies), use of symbols and the inclusion of cosmic elements in construction would result in culturally appropriate housing that preserve health, well being, comfort, rational use of resources and identity assertiveness. In summary, a holistic approach to housing and the principle of cultural diversity will favourably foster the development of indigenous peoples while contributing to the inclusion of new elements in relevant public policies.
Goal 8:

**Develop a global partnership for development**

1.12 Targets 12 – 15:

Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system. This includes a commitment to good governance, development and poverty reduction, both nationally and internationally.

Since this analysis is based on the perspective of indigenous peoples, it should be stated that conditions for increased production and productivity should be a pre-requisite for the development of any trade system. This implies (in agriculture, for instance), fostering a comprehensive land reform that would include access to and ownership over lands, credit reforms to incorporate new financial rules, or changes in technical assistance to achieve cultural relevance. Without the first step to improve production, no progress would be feasible in the development of a real alternative trade system. On the contrary, intermediary activities would be strengthened. With their initiatives, indigenous and peasant organizations have already taken some first steps towards the so-called “third way markets”. Such markets deserve to be supported through public policies that are respectful of indigenous peoples’ realities. Microeconomic integration is a key factor in the achievement of this Target.
An open financial market would not bear positive results without a comprehensive reform of the financial system’s rules, based on the logic of profitability and market conditions, while operating in the midst of multicultural societies that have preserved other rationale for economic and financial management. Conditions for credit access, for instance, run counter to the situation of poor people and, even more so, of indigenous peoples. This leads us to think that a new decentralized financial network of institutions should be created (in urban and rural areas and with linguistically relevant elements); that additional human resources should be identified (social and organizational factor); that local realities should be taken into account, for instance, the quality of soils, close or distant location of markets, existence or absence of road infrastructure, in order to incorporate all these elements as building block of this new financial network of institutions that would enable real access to credit.

There are different, though still disperse, initiatives in this sense. Community savings and loans institutions have been set up to provide joint credit to community members or affiliates. They operate under the economic principle of Ranti-Ranti, or reciprocity and mutual fair gain. These experiences have been successful regarding delinquency rates.

If experiences such as the above can operate in the daily context of our societies with rules derived from different cultural codes, then the current financial system rules and institutions must be modified. Thus, poor people and indigenous peoples would become direct financial agents and would not be reduced to mere credit recipients, in the best of scenarios. There is therefore an urgent need for change, as suggested by ECLAC in its survey on indigenous peoples in the Americas:

**Address the special needs of the least developed countries.**

This includes free access to tariff and quotas for the exports of the least developed countries; enhanced programmes of debit relief of highly-indebted poor countries (HIPC’s) and the cancellation of official bilateral debt; and more generous official assistance for development (OAD) for countries committed to poverty reduction.

Two clearly differentiated aspects emerge from this Target. First, the treatment of least developed countries in some kind of “ideal list of mendicity and homogeneity”, since no distinction is made of internal asymmetries within countries. In dealing with tariffs, the emphasis is put on “exports and imports”, activities that are usually undertaken by economically powerful groups. Within this context, this Target, as proposed, would aim at strengthening the situation of those “Have” countries, instead of eradicating poverty, in association with individuals who, in spite of their material situation, have immaterial potential, such as being members of small organizations that develop other rules and perspectives.

As far as indigenous peoples are concerned, this Target completely excludes them as collective subjects.
Consequently, besides improved conditions for increased production and the development of indigenous peoples to be generated with relevant multicultural public policies, the resources obtained through “enhanced programmes of debit relief” and “the cancellation of official bilateral debt”, as the second element identified in this Target, should be channelled for investments in indigenous peoples, taking into account their priorities and agendas. In this regard, it is of paramount importance to consider the provisions of ILO Convention 169, adopted as a binding instrument.

**Address the special needs of landlocked countries and small island developing States.**

The content of this Target lacks a pluri-cultural approach and reiterates handout measures that increase dependency, in-keeping with the agenda of whoever provides support.

It is, therefore, important to deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term.

Addressing the debt problem, as proposed under the framework of this Target, would place us in the status of “eternal debtors”. The burden of the debt is today one of the most significant hurdles in the path towards development. The question would then be Who finances whose development?
"In 2003, transfers made by countries in the South (this is, the least developed countries) to the North (developed countries) were estimated at over 370 billion dollars in payment of their debt. This figure represents over five times the contribution made by countries in the North as official aid for development, i.e. 69 billion dollars. Interest represents almost half of the amount paid as debt service."6

Several conceptual frameworks have emerged around the illegitimate debt with categories that refer to: debts of oppression, ear debts, debts of corruption, elites debts, development debts that have been invested in failed projects, with disastrous consequences for human beings, peoples and the environment. Beyond this, there are still historic debts with indigenous peoples. This is not only related to indigenous peoples identity and to the beginning of the persistent colonizing process, but also to the fact that the development of the wealth accumulated by the (countries in) the North have been financed by plundering natural resources and exploiting human beings in the South.7

This is further compounded by “social debt” caused by social impacts that have widened the gap between rich and poor; the increasingly dramatic “ecologic debt” with problems such as the hole in the ozone layer, the intensification


of the greenhouse effect, the loss of biodiversity, the depletion of resources, air contamination and pollution, among others, as consequences that cannot be dissociated from the current economic system and that have an impact throughout the planet beyond the borders where they were generated."\(^8\)

In other words, both the economic system in its structural nature and lifestyles linked to unbridled consuming habits must undergo a radical change in order to build an equitable and fair economic order, together with societies with holistic views and actions that would preserve the human being-nature-society balance.

It could be concluded, therefore, that indigenous peoples have suffered the most from the debt problem. Not only have they been victims of colonial usurpation, but they are also paying for a debt which is not theirs. The resources obtained through debts contracted by successive governments have not been invested to benefit indigenous peoples, but domestic legal frameworks, either through taxes or with the lack of investment in indigenous areas, force them to repay. Hence the argument in favour of ceasing debt payments in order to free resources that could and should be invested in the development of indigenous peoples and the eradication of poverty and hunger.

\(^8\) Idem. Page. 158.
**1.13 Target 16:**

In cooperation with developing countries, develop and implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth.

This Target’s approach breaks up the concept of *ayllu*, of the family and the economic system based on principles such as community work, or *minga*, reciprocity, *ayni* (cooperation and solidarity), *maquipurarina* (production and exchange), and *ranti-ranti* (trade and financial relations). Decent work – *llankana* (be doing), emerges from a community effort with generation and gender awareness.

It is worth noting that the “generation” principle is based on age, as it is in the western perspective. In the case of young people, “generation” is related more to responsibilities than to age. This means that, from the “be-exist-doing” perspective, if a person is ready to assume contracts or be married at 14 or 15 years of age, as adolescent men (*wanpra*) or women (*cuitza*), he or she is mature enough and may have savings such as livestock or land, or may have a skill or craft, and above that he or she may have the sense of belonging to the *ayllu*, or the family-community where autonomous work is always present.

Therefore, in order to achieve this Target, the dynamics set in motion by young indigenous men and women to consolidate their family and community environment must be supported without undermining the cohesion or unity of their social and collective processes. All strategies must be designed for the community entity to which the young indigenous man or woman belongs. In other words, strategies designed to benefit indigenous youth should not relegate the meaning, subject or reality of the community to a minor role.
1.14 Target 17:

In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable essential drugs in developing countries.

In the analysis of this Target, we shall refer to John le Carré’s words when he states that each year, millions of square kilometres of tropical forests disappear, native agricultural communities are systematically dispossessed of their livelihoods, displaced and left homeless; those who protest against this are hung and shot at; the most pristine corners of the world are invaded and desecrated while tropical forests become decaying moorlands in the midst of which outrageous megalopolis are found infested with diseases. Everything is allowed to the Big Pharma (pharmaceutical companies) since its work benefits the entire world and, whoever thinks otherwise is a neo-communist heretic.

The formulation of this Target gives the impression that we should follow the path leading to the legitimate recognition of bio-piracy and bio-prospection; both systematic practices of large pharmaceutical companies.

Indigenous peoples, through their organizations, such as the Confederation of Indigenous Organizations of the Amazon Basin (Confederación de Organizaciones Indígenas de la Cuenca Amazónica - COICA), the

9 John Le Carré is an English writer and researcher.

10 Bio-piracy, defined as “the use of intellectual property rights to obtain the legitimate recognition of property entitlement over and the exclusive control of biological knowledge and resources with no recognition, reward or protection given to the contribution of informal innovators”.

11 It refers to the study of biological diversity in order to discover organisms that might have a commercial application.
Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of the Amazon Region of Ecuador (Confederación de las Nacionalidades Indígenas de la Amazonía Ecuatoriana - CONFENIAE), the Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of Ecuador (Confederación de Nacionalidades Indígenas del Ecuador - CONAIE), defend their intellectual property rights over their ancestral knowledge on medicinal plants, agricultural products, micro-organisms, genetic sequences and other land or aquatic living organisms. On the other hand, the Big Pharma, with the complicity and support of Governments of the day, defend their intellectual property rights arguing that they have invested in the final discovery of active principles and fail to observe the provisions of the Convention on Biological Diversity (not signed by the United States) that establish the sovereign right of all countries over their biodiversity and the equitable distribution of benefits derived from their exploitation.

In 1997, Russel Mittermeier and his team of scientists identified Ecuador as one of the 17 most mega-diverse countries in the world; that is, one of the countries with greatest biological diversity (home to 70% of all animal and plant species found on the planet). Ecuador is the seventh most bio-diverse country in vascular plants. Pharmaceutical transnational corporations are the only and exclusive beneficiaries of this vast wealth. Time and again it is reiterated in scientific magazines and journals around the world that 90% of pharmaceutical components come from plants and that their discovery is linked to native peoples’ traditional knowledge. Hundreds of industries and institutes study indigenous peoples, particularly in the Amazon Region. Without indigenous peoples’ informed consent however, they have carried out ethno-botanical research and not only have they appropriated themselves of ancestral knowledge, but they have also obtained patents for it.
This is how the active principle of the Aya Huasca was patented and only after a long battle waged by COICA did the United States Patent and Trademark Office finally refuse granting this patent. Nonetheless, other products have not been as fortunate; a case in point is the patents granted to Conrad Gorinski, over two active principles called Cunaniol y Rupununine (obtained from barbasco, a plant traditionally used for fishing by indigenous peoples of the Amazon Region), who are currently produced and sold by him.

It is obvious that bio-piracy and bio-prospection by large pharmaceutical corporations who “discover” active principles of wild species in tropical forest and in the Amazon jungles, aided by the ancestral knowledge of indigenous peoples, will continue in the absence of adequate laws to regulate this activity amidst the lackadaisical and unconcerned attitude of Governments.

In this scenario, indigenous peoples’ voice has been, and is, the dissident voice, the unheard and muted voice of protest. They propose legal restrictions to the control of pharmaceutical companies over their own patents. They propose a law to protect intellectual property rights over biodiversity and their ancestral knowledge. If these regulatory frameworks were to be adopted, it would be forbidden to patent the complete drug development process (currently patents cover the manufacturing methods, the presentation: gel, tablets, the required dose: daily, every 12, 8 hours etc.). Pharmaceutical companies obtain patents to cover each insignificant phase in a drug’s life cycle and thus, they hinder the production of generic drugs by local or national manufacturers who could produce and sell the drugs at a fraction of the cost of the commercial price set by pharmaceutical companies. This would expand the benefits to all human beings and would set adequate legal standards to protect the country’s biodiversity.
An objective attitude is required when the honest and humane cooperation of pharmaceutical companies is proposed or is believed to be feasible. If we really want people to have access to essential drugs, we must follow Brazil’s example. This country produces its own retroviral drugs (for HIV/AIDS treatment) at a cost of 700 dollars for a year’s supply (compared to the 10,000 dollars a year charged by pharmaceutical companies) and distributes them to any Brazilian man or woman who needs them, regardless of whether they can afford to pay for the drugs or not.

In sum, there is a need for a coalition between the government, indigenous peoples and civil society to stimulate the recovery and protection of indigenous peoples’ ancestral knowledge that could bring about benefits for the Ecuadorian population and even to humanity as a whole.

1.15 Target 18

In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially in information and communications.

It is not fair to set as a target for developing countries the prospect of becoming the only the recipients of the benefits of new technologies whether they are related to information or communication. A multicultural public policy must be established to deal not only with access to and use of technologies, but should also include investment in research and innovation, development and control of new technologies.
Two practical examples can illustrate this point:

1. Indigenous communities in Costa Rica have developed a software that has been sold to US companies.

2. In the parishes of San Juan and San Andres of the Canton of Riobamba, in the Province of Chimborazo, in Ecuador, indigenous communities have carried out a comprehensive census (demographic, agricultural, housing, irrigation systems, river basins, farmland, etc.) with community cooperation, using technology, native language and creating a software that can be shared with other indigenous communities in the country and elsewhere.

Discrimination is nothing but a tool for domination. When it is done away with, an irreversible step towards transition is made. The ultimate goal would be that indigenous peoples’ view of the world (knowledge, science, culture, and traditions), could be part of the country’s daily experiences. The democratization of knowledge, understood as the openness to coexist with other nationalities, such as indigenous peoples, shall enable a new pact between civilizations to build a just and fair world where the universal principle of cultural diversity would be respected, promoted and consolidated.
CHAPTER II

PROPOSED TARGETS AND INDICATORS
OF THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS
WITH GREATER RELEVANCE
FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES
CHAPTER II

PROPOSED TARGETS AND INDICATORS OF THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS WITH GREATER RELEVANCE FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

In this section, examples are given to illustrate a new orientation that could be given to the Millennium Development Goals, that should be adapted to each peoples' realities. This could generate other exercises where indigenous peoples could express their own Targets.

According to specific contexts, a quantification of the proposed indicators will be established.

Goal 1:

Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger

2.1 Target 1:

Increase by 50% until 2015, the restitution of territories to indigenous peoples and increase their capacity to save.

Indicators:

- ..........% of indigenous peoples and nationalities with community deeds over their lands and territories.

- ..........% of indigenous peoples and nationalities with access to credit in which due account is taken of their view of the world (credit reimbursement as per the agricultural calendar and others). This credit should have an impact on the implementation of the principle according to which the greater the conservation of traditions and practices, the greater the autonomy.
2.2 Target 2:

Halve, between and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger.

Indicators:

- ..........% of increase in diversified savings, understood as the increase in the production of foodstuffs, small and large livestock, among others.
- ..........% of indigenous peoples who have learned again how to use and consume (individually and collectively) produce with higher nutritional value (quinoa, mashua,...) and who contribute to strengthen ancestral knowledge and to the adequate management of biodiversity.

Goal 2:

Achieve universal primary education

2.3 Target 3:

Until 2015, indigenous boys and girls would have finished a complete course of primary schooling. Life awareness and intercultural methodologies would have been adopted to foster the consolidation of their ethnic and cultural identity, as well as their self-esteem.

Indicators:

- .......... % of indigenous boys and girls who have completed their primary education.
% of indigenous boys and girls who have reasserted their identity and self-esteem (clothing, languages, traditions, values, security and others).

% of indigenous boys and girls who read, write and speak in their native languages.

% of education material designed and used to promote true intercultural relations and education.

Goal 3:

Promote gender equality and empower women

2.4 Target 4:

Achieve equitable opportunities in primary and secondary education, emphasizing the complementary nature of indigenous girls and boys and adolescent men and women, and at all levels of education by 2015.

Indicators:

% of adolescent indigenous men and women who have completed secondary education.

% of adolescent indigenous men and women who read, write and speak in their mother tongue.
MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS, AN INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PERSPECTIVE

- .......... % of adolescent indigenous men and women who preserve their identity and have reasserted their self-esteem.

- .......... % of education material where the ethnic and culturally relevant approach has been integrated.

Goal 4: Reduce child mortality

2.5 Target 5:

Reduce by two thirds, until 2015, the under-five year olds mortality rate, through the delivery of intercultural and holistic health services.

Indicators:

- System of indicators that includes the ethnic variable, designed and implemented at national level with disaggregated data up to community level.

- .......... % of annual reduction of mother and child mortality (monitoring and assessment)

- .......... % of health services that have implemented the family health history.

- .......... % of health services that reviewed their protocols, norms, standards and procedures to integrate their ethnic and cultural relevance for indigenous populations.
PROPOSED TARGETS AND INDICATORS OF THE MDGs WITH RELEVANCE FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

- % of community health care providers incorporated to national health systems.
- % of community health systems that receive financial resources.
- Number of protocols that take into account ancestral knowledge and practices that have been incorporated in health services delivery (treatments with medicinal plants that improve respiratory ailments, diarrheal diseases and others).
- % of health facilities that have adopted vertical childbirth.
- Number of emergency and timely health care systems that have been established in coordination with health care services and the communities.
- % of staff members who speak native mother tongues that have been incorporated in health services.

Goal 5:

Improve maternal health

2.6 Target 6:

Reduce by three quarters, until 2015, the maternal mortality ratio through the delivery of intercultural and holistic health services.
Indicators:

- System of indicators that includes the ethnic variable, designed and implemented at national level with disaggregated data up to community level.

- .......... % of annual reduction of mother and child mortality (monitoring and assessment)

- .......... % of health services that have implemented the family health history.

- .......... % of health services that reviewed their protocols, norms, standards and procedures to integrate their ethnic and cultural relevance for indigenous populations.

- .......... % of community health care providers incorporated to national health systems.

- .......... % of community health systems that receive financial resources.

- Number of protocols that take into account ancestral knowledge and practices that have been incorporated in health services delivery (treatments with medicinal plants that improve respiratory ailments, diarrheal diseases and others)

- .......... % of health facilities that have adopted vertical childbirth.

- Number of emergency and timely health care systems that have been established in coordination with health care services and the communities.

- .......... % of staff members who speak native mother tongues that have been incorporated in health services.
Goal 6:

**Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases.**

2.7 Target 7:

Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS, taking into account indigenous peoples view of the world on sexuality and incorporating a human rights and collective rights approach.

Indicators:

- System of indicators that includes the ethnic variable, designed and implemented at national level with disaggregated data up to community level.

- Number of education and training materials on sexual and reproductive health that take into account their ethnic and cultural relevance for indigenous peoples, which have been designed and used.

- ..........% of the annual reduction in the number of people with HIV/AIDS (monitoring and assessment).

- .......... % of community councils working on sexual and reproductive rights, human rights and collective rights in each indigenous people and nationality.
2.8 Target 8:

Have begun to reverse, by 2015, the incidence of malaria and other major diseases, incorporating the holistic approach to health of indigenous peoples in health programmes.

Indicators:

- System of indicators that includes the ethnic variable, designed and implemented at national level with disaggregated data up to community level.

- Number of education and training materials on preventive health (at family and community level) that take into account their ethnic and cultural relevance for indigenous peoples, which have been designed and used.

- % of the annual reduction in the number of people with malaria, dengue fever, tuberculosis and other major diseases. (Baseline for the epidemiological profile of indigenous peoples).

- % of indigenous peoples and nationalities where sanitary, environmental and housing conditions have been improved.

- Number and % of sectors and stakeholders that work together with indigenous peoples and nationalities to eradicate the roots causes of malaria, tuberculosis, dengue fever and other major diseases.
Goal 7:

Ensure environmental sustainability

2.9 Target 9:

Integrate in national policies and programs the principles of sustainable development, as perceived by indigenous peoples in their view of the world, and reverse the loss of environmental resources.

Indicators

- ........ % of genetically eroded lands under recovery.
- Number of seed banks kept by indigenous communities that receive support from the national government.
- Number of germoplasms banks at national level where native endangered species are protected.
- Number of genetic banks of plants, reptiles, mammals and birds of the Ecuadorian flora and fauna.
- ........ % annual rate of reduction of deforestation.
- Legislative framework that hinders and penalises the extraction of natural resources.
- Implementation and application of indigenous legislation to individuals or corporations that log, destroy, misuse or commercialize natural resources, particularly those found in places considered as sacred sites by indigenous peoples (forests, medicinal plants, animals, among others).
2.10 Target 10:

Have, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to water.

Indicators:

- .......... % of indigenous peoples and nationalities that protect water sources and river basins with the support of the national government.

- .......... % of sacred sites protected under the national legislation and indigenous peoples law from plundering or unlawful appropriation by people alien to indigenous territories.

- .......... % of sacred lands and sites handed over as community lands to indigenous peoples for their management, conservation and protection.

- .......... % of annual increase in irrigations systems designed and implemented according to indigenous peoples view of the world.

- .......... % increase in the use and consumption of safe water supply in indigenous peoples and nationalities.
2.11 Target 11:

**By 2020, to have achieved significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers.**

Indicators:

- .......... % of indigenous peoples and nationalities that own their houses, built through community work, in *mingas*, and using alternative financing methods.

- .......... % of non for profit private or State organizations that support house ownership under schemes consistent with indigenous peoples view of the world.

- .......... % of indigenous peoples and nationalities that receive financial support for the development of productive activities.

Goal 8:

**Develop a global partnership for development**

2.12 Targets 12-15:

**By 2015, obtain a total cancellation of the official debt which is considered illegitimate**

Indicators:

- .......... % of financial resources derived from the non-payment of the external debt that is invested in the sustainable and sustained development of indigenous peoples and nationalities.
2.13 Target 16:

By 2015, succeed in generating productive employment for economically active men and women, by introducing greater dynamism in local, national and regional economies.

Indicators:

- Number and % of individual, family or community productive initiatives (including intellectual initiatives) that have been adopted as multicultural public policies by the national government, or by private non-profit entities, and that have materialized in the allocation of financial resources.

- ........ % of indigenous men and women associated to individual, family or community enterprises.

2.14 Target 17:

States, with the support of civil society in general and indigenous peoples in particular, protect biodiversity, including genetic and biological resources, and provide access to essential drugs, applying the principles of sovereignty and social protection.

Indicators:

- Legal framework that regulates bio-prospection and sanctions bio-piracy.
2.15 Target 18:

In cooperation with the private sector, States must ensure the technologic and scientific development of indigenous peoples and nationalities, and make available to the benefits of new information and communication technologies.

Indicadores:

- Number of indigenous people graduated in Information and communication careers.
- Number of indigenous communities that use ITC technological tools.
- Number of indigenous communities that use software packages designed by indigenous technical experts.
- Number of studies on the impact of technology and communications in indigenous populations.
CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS TO:

THE STATES,

THE UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM
AND OTHER COOPERATION AGENCIES,

INDIGENOUS PEOPLES,

REGARDING MAIN ACTIONS AND STRATEGIES
TO BE DEVELOPED IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE
THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS
IN AREAS INHABITED BY INDIGENOUS POPULATIONS
CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE STATES, THE UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM AND OTHER COOPERATION AGENCIES, INDIGENOUS PEOPLES, REGARDING MAIN ACTIONS AND STRATEGIES TO BE DEVELOPED IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS IN AREAS INHABITED BY INDIGENOUS POPULATIONS

3.1 RECOMMENDATIONS TO STATES

► Adopt the principle of cultural diversity as the guiding axis for all policies, programmes, projects, strategies and actions.

► Take the needs identified and prioritized by indigenous peoples as the point of departure.

► Incorporate the direct participation of indigenous peoples in decision-making processes, as well as in the development and implementation of plans and programmes. This implies that the practice of minga/mink’a, or collective/community work should be reintroduced, recovered, integrated and strengthened within indigenous societies.

► Incorporate the new development dimensions promoted by indigenous peoples as a contribution intended to benefit humanity as a whole.

► Amend current legislation, generate new intercultural jurisprudence and design multicultural public policies.
► Adopt operational mechanisms, as secondary legislation, for the operative implementation of collective rights.

► Avoid national averages and develop ethnically, culturally, gender and generation-relevant indicators where communities will be the first geographic unit.

► Channel financial resources to activities, programmes or projects, jointly identified with indigenous peoples, which would contribute to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals and Targets.

3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM AND OTHER COOPERATION AGENCIES

► Adopt the principle of cultural diversity as the guiding axis for all policies, programmes, projects, strategies and actions.

► Take needs identified and prioritized by indigenous peoples as the point of departure.

► Incorporate the direct participation of indigenous peoples in decision-making processes, as well as in the development and implementation of plans and programmes. This implies that the practice of minga/mink’a, or collective/community work, should be reintroduced, recovered, integrated and strengthened within indigenous societies.
Incorporate the new development dimensions promoted by indigenous peoples as a contribution intended to benefit humanity as a whole.

Use indigenous technical assistance and financial aid to support processes of concerted action among indigenous peoples aimed at modifying existing legislations, generate new intercultural jurisprudence and design multicultural public policies.

Use indigenous technical assistance and financial aid to support processes of concerted action among indigenous peoples aimed at identifying operational mechanisms, as secondary legislation, and other means, to enable the full exercise of collective rights.

Use indigenous technical assistance and financial aid to support the development of ethnically, culturally, gender and generation-relevant indicators where communities will be the first geographic unit.

Respect the agendas developed by indigenous peoples. In 2005, the German cooperation agency, GTZ, undertook an assessment of its cooperation activities in Ecuador, Bolivia and Guatemala. In one of their findings, they acknowledge that one of their weaknesses has been the priorities set from their vision and which are far removed from the demands of indigenous peoples. Hence, one of their goals in their new form of cooperation is to collaborate within the agenda established by indigenous peoples, according to their view of the world and contents.
3.3 RECOMMENDATIONS TO INDIGENOUS PEOPLES, NATIONALITIES AND ORGANIZATIONS

- Take up the work of grassroots organizations, indigenous communities and peoples who live in the national territory and agree upon a common agenda for development by sector, identifying roles, responsibilities and resources of all stakeholders and the State.

- Succeed until 2015, in achieving the restitution of territories to indigenous peoples with the support of the national and international community.

- Promote the adoption of the principle of cultural diversity as the guiding axis for all policies, programmes, projects, strategies and actions.

- Take needs identified and prioritized by indigenous peoples as the point of departure, specifically taking into account each peoples and nationality (Coastal Region, Highlands and Amazon Region).

- Promote and achieve the direct participation of indigenous peoples in decision-making processes, as well as in the development and implementation of plans and programmes. This implies that the practice of minga/mink’a, or collective/community work, should be reintroduced, recovered, integrated and strengthened within indigenous societies.
Foster and largely disseminate the new development dimensions promoted by indigenous peoples as a contribution intended to benefit humanity as a whole, using their own available resources and from other partners.

Create awareness among and obtain support from civil society, political stakeholders and cooperation agencies in order to modify existing legislations, generate new intercultural jurisprudence and design multicultural public policies.

Propose operational mechanisms, as secondary legislation, for the operative implementation of collective rights.

Lead the development of ethnically, culturally, gender and generation-relevant indicators where communities will be the first geographic unit.

Channel financial resources from the State, as well as from national and international agencies, to activities, programmes or projects, jointly identified with indigenous peoples from the Coastal, Andean and Amazon Regions, which would contribute to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals and Targets.